NYT Digits - Algorithms and Mathematics JFR Journal Club

Mobolaji Williams, July 25 2023

NYT Digits - Rules of the Game



I.You are given six numbers and a target number.

2. The goal is to reproduce the target number from any combination from the set of six numbers using the operations addition, subtraction, division, and multiplication.

3. In combining numbers, divisions cannot have remainders and subtractions cannot result in negative numbers.



Main Question

Can we devise an algorithm to solve this problem?

Supplementary Questions

And what can the algorithm tell us about the nature of the solutions to this problem and this problem's computational complexity?

Presentation Outline





How can we count the number of solutions to the puzzle?





Part IV

ChatGPT

this problem?

Part I: Algorithms



PartI: Incremental Programming



Rather than solving the full "six number" puzzle, we try to solve the "two-number" puzzle, "threenumber" puzzle, "four number" puzzle and so on. **Refined Question:** How can we find all valid computational combinations of **six numbers** that yield a target number?

We will use the principle of **incremental development**

"The goal of incremental development is to avoid long debugging sessions by adding and testing only a small amount of code at a time."

- How to Think Like a Computer Scientist

Incremental Question: How can we find all valid computational combinations of two numbers that yield a target number?

•

Part I: Two-Number Combinations

Incremental Question: How can we find all valid computational combinations of two **numbers** that yield a target number?

> **Refined Incremental Question #I:** How can we generate all valid computational combinations of two numbers?

Example: We have the numbers 1 and 2

Possible Combinations:

 $2+1, 2-1, 2 \times 1, 2/1$

If we already have the combinations, we can **easily** find the ones that match a given number. The **difficult** part is generating these combinations

But we want to keep track of both the "names" of the combinations and their "results" and so we want a function that does both tasks

Example:

```
gen_two_combos({'1': 1, '2': 2})
2 >>> {'(2+1)': 3, '(2*1)': 2, '(2/1)': 2, '(2-1)': 1}
```

6



Part I: Two-Number Combinations

Refined Incremental Question #1: How can	1	def gen_
we generate all valid computational	2	
	3	# so
combinations of two numbers?	4	# and
	5	sort
	6	
Evampla	7	# ac
Example.	8	name
We have the numbers 1 and 2	9	
	10	# fo
	11	elem
Possible Combinations	12	name
	13	
$2 + 1$, $2 - 1$, 2×1 , $2/1$	14	# ge
	15	# in
	16	# an
	17	comb
	18	
We want to keep track of both the	19	
"names" of the combinations and their	20	
""	21	
results and so we want a function that	22	retu
does both tasks.		
names		
Λ less λ (such that the property of the solution)		
- Also want to prevent Dad	1	gen_two_
operations from leading to valid values	2	>>> {'(2

```
two_combos(value_dict):
ort dictionary by value to ensure subtractions are not negative
d divisions are greater than 1
ced_vals = dict(sorted(value_dict.items(), key=lambda item: item[1], reverse=True))
cess the list of string names and the list of associated integers
_list, num_list = list(sorted_vals.keys()), list(sorted_vals.values())
r writing simplicity
1, elem2 = num_list
                                                           results
1, name2 = name_list
enerating all combinations
ternal if conditional yields a large number if the division
d subtraction constraints are violated
oo_dict = {'('+name1+'+'+name2+')':elem1 + elem2,
          '('+name1+'*'+name2+')':elem1 * elem2,
          '('+name1+'/'+name2+')': int(elem1/elem2) if elem1%elem2==0 else 1/3001,
          '('+name1+'-'+name2+')': elem1- elem2 if elem1- elem2>0 else 1/3001 }
```

```
urn combo_dict
```

```
o_combos({'1': 1, '2': 2})
(2+1)': 3, '(2*1)': 2, '(2/1)': 2, '(2-1)': 1}
```



Part I: Three-Number Combinations

solved the tw	o number problem		AW
r	next we have		Say v can o
Refined Increm we generate all combinations of	ental Question #2: How valid computational ^f three numbers?	can	- If v hav
We can use the the <mark>three numb</mark>	two number solutions for er solutions.	or	- We nev cor
			- We the we
Answer: The var three numbers of	ious ways to combine consists of		
	$\begin{pmatrix} 3\\2 \end{pmatrix}$		(4 way
=	the ways to select two numbers from three	\bigotimes	the ways to con two selected nu

/orked Example

we have three numbers 1, 2, and 3. What are the various ways we combine these numbers using our four operations?

we select two numbers 1 and 2 and multiply them, then we would we the number 2 in addition to the original unselected 3.

'e would now have two numbers. We can then combine this 2 = 2 and the old 3 in all the ways that two numbers can be mbined.

'e know there are four ways to combine two numbers, so to find e various ways to combine three numbers, we can first ask how can e form two numbers from three numbers.

Binomial coefficient*

lys)

nbine those umbers



the ways to combine the result of the two-number combinations with the third unselected number

(4 ways)



Part I: Three-Number Combinations

Refined Incremental Question #2: How can we generate all valid computational combinations of three numbers?

We can use the two number solutions for the three number solutions.

```
def gen_three_combos(start_dict):
 2
        # empty dictionary to house combo outputs
 3
        output_dict = dict()
        for key, value in start_dict.items():
            # define copy of three number combination
                                                        #I)
            copy_dict = start_dict.copy()
            del copy_dict[key] # eliminate one number from the three
9
10
            # for all combinations of the two remaining numbers \#2)
11
            for name, elem in gen_two_combos(copy_dict).items():
12
                # create combinations of the two-number result and the unselected number
13
                new_dict = {name: elem, key:value }
14
                result_dict = gen_two_combos(new_dict) #3
15
                output_dict.update(result_dict)
16
17
18
        return output_dict
```

Answer: The various ways to combine three numbers consists of...

Python 🛱

the ways to select two numbers from three

#I)

#2)



the ways to combine those two selected numbers



the ways to combine the result of the two-number combinations with the third unselected number. #3)

Example:

In [6]:	<pre>gen_three_combos({'1': 1, '2': 2, '3': 3}</pre>
Out[6]:	<pre>{'((3+2)+1)': 6, '((3+2)*1)': 5, '((3+2)/1)': 5, '((3+2)-1)': 4, '((3*2)+1)': 7, '((3*2)*1)': 6, '((3*2)/1)': 6, '((3*2)-1)': 5, '(1+(3/2))': 1.000333222259247, '(1+(3/2))': 0.0003332222592469177, '(1/(3/2))': 0.0003332222592469177, '(1/(3/2))': 0.99996667777407531, '((3-2)+1)': 2,</pre>

Part I: Four-Number Combinations

Refined Incremental Ouestion #3: How can	1	
we concrete all valid computational	2	
we generate all valid computational	3	
combinations of four numbers ?	4	
	5	
	7	
We use the same logic as that for the three	8	
	9	
number and two number combinations	10	
	11	
	12	
#I. Choose subsets of numbers	13	
#? Ruild up the solution up from the lower	14	
	15	
order solutions	16	
	17	
	18	
	19	
This procedure is reminiscent of something	20	
that is common in combination and	21	
programming problems	22	
programming problems	23	
	24	
	25	
Decursive preservations Duild up a calution	20	
recursive programming: Build up a solution	27	
by referring to solutions to sub-problems	20	
	30	
	50	

This helps us formulate the general solution

```
from itertools import combinations
def gen_four_combos(start_dict):
   output_dict = dict()
   # split four numbers into three numbers and one number
   for key, value in start_dict.items():
       copy_dict = start_dict.copy() #
       del copy_dict[key]
       for name, elem in gen_three_combos(copy_dict).items():
           new_dict = {name: elem, key:value }
                                                            #2
           result_dict = gen_two_combos(new_dict)
           output_dict.update(result_dict)
   # split four numbers into two numbers and two numbers
   for elem in list(combinations((start_dict.keys()), 2)):
       copy_dict = start_dict.copy()
                                     #I)
       del copy_dict[elem[0]]
       del copy_dict[elem[1]]
       comp_copy_dict = {elem[0]:start_dict[elem[0]], elem[1]:start_dict[elem[1]]}
       for key1, value1 in gen_two_combos(copy_dict).items():
           for key2, value2 in gen_two_combos(comp_copy_dict).items():
               new_dict = {key1: value1, key2:value2 }
                                                        #2)
               result_dict = gen_two_combos(new_dict)
               output_dict.update(result_dict)
```

return output_dict



Part I: General Combinations

Refined Incremental Question #4: How can we find all valid computational combinations of **any list of numbers***?

```
Python
 1 from itertools import combinations
    from math import comb
    # generates all manipulation combinations of a dictionary of elements
    def generator_combos(start_dict: dict):
        # defining dict_len to determine pathing
        dict_len = len(start_dict)
 8
 9
10
        # defining output dictionary
11
        output_dict = dict()
12
13
        count = 0
14
15
        # output the dictionary if there is just one element
16
        if dict_len==1:
17
            output_dict = start_dict
18
19
        # output all ways to add, subtract, multiply, or divide two numbers
20
        elif dict_len==2:
21
            # sort to ensure division is >= 1 and subtraction is >= 0
            sorted_vals = dict(sorted(start_dict.items(), key=lambda item: item[1], reverse=True))
22
23
24
            # list of names and numbers
            name_list, num_list = list(sorted_vals.keys()), list(sorted_vals.values())
25
26
27
            # getting elements and there names
28
            elem1, elem2 = num_list
            name1, name2 = name_list
29
30
            # set of all possible operations with keys for operation name
31
32
            # Note: digits game doesn't allow fractions or negative numbers
33
            # so we set the result to a large
            output_dict = {'('+name1+'+'+name2+')':elem1 + elem2,
34
                           '('+name1+'*'+name2+')':elem1 * elem2,
35
36
                           '('+name1+'/'+name2+')': int(elem1/elem2) if elem1%elem2==0 else 1/3001,
                           '('+name1+'-'+name2+')': elem1- elem2 if elem1- elem2>0 else 1/3001 }
37
38
```

*We are generalizing the problem to any list of numbers

```
38
39
        # for dict_len >=3, recursively build sub solutions
40
        else:
41
42
            # only go up to half the number of elements in dict
            # to prevent double counting (e.g., n choose k = n choose n-k)
43
            for ix in range(1, dict_len//2+1):
44
45
                # number of ways to select 'ix' elements from 'dict_len' total
46
                num_comb = comb(dict_len, ix)
47
48
49
                 # limiting number of combinations considered
50
                # when there is an even split; this prevents double counting
51
                if ix == dict_len/2:
52
                     \lim = \operatorname{num_comb}//2
53
                else:
54
                     lim = num_comb
55
56
                # generating combinations of elements
                # '[:lim]' prevents double consideration of combos
57
58
                for elem in list(combinations(start_dict.keys(), ix))[:lim]:
59
                    copy_dict = start_dict.copy()
                    comp_copy_dict = dict() # complement of copy_dict
60
61
                    for j in range(ix):
                         del copy_dict[elem[j]]
62
                                                                              Recursion
                         comp_copy_dict[elem[j]] = start_dict[elem[j]]
63
64
                    # generating set of possible operations for elements
65
                    for key1, value1 in generator_combos(copy_dict).items():
66
                         for key2, value2 in generator_combos(comp_copy_dict).items():
67
                             new_dict = {key1: value1, key2: value2 }
68
                             result_dict = generator_combos(new_dict)
69
70
                             output_dict.update(result_dict)
71
                             count += len(result dict)
72
73
74
        return output_dict
```



Part I: NYT Digits Solver (Easy Part)

Example:

In [9]:	<pre>generator_combos({'1':1, '2': 2, '3': 3, '4': 4, '5':5 })</pre>
Out[9]:	<pre>{'((((5+4)+3)+2)+1)': 15, '((((5+4)+3)+2)+1)': 14, '((((5+4)+3)+2)-1)': 13, '((((5+4)+3)*2)+1)': 25, '((((5+4)+3)*2)+1)': 24, '((((5+4)+3)*2)-1)': 23, '(((((5+4)+3)/2)+1)': 7, '(((((5+4)+3)/2)+1)': 7, '(((((5+4)+3)/2)+1)': 6, '(((((5+4)+3)/2)+1)': 6, '(((((5+4)+3)-2)+1)': 10, '(((((5+4)+3)-2)/1)': 10,</pre>
Orig valid	ginal Refined Question: How can we find all combinations of any list of

numbers that yield a target number?

"If we already have the combinations, we can **easily** find the ones that match a given number. The **difficult** part is generating these combinations"

```
Python
def nyt_digits_solver(num_list: list, target: int, soln_num=None):
    # generating full list of combinations of all sizes for the input numbers
    soln_set_dict = dict()
    for i in range(2, len(num_list) + 1):
        for combo in list(combinations(num_list, i)):
            dict_conv = {str(num):num for num in list(combo)}
            soln_dict = generator_combos(dict_conv)  ''past IO slides''
            soln_set_dict.update(soln_dict)
    # enumerating all solutions (i.e., combinations that result in target)
    solns = [key for key in soln_set_dict if soln_set_dict[key]==target] <-- " min"</pre>
    # find the `soln_num`-shortest solutions (by char count)
    if soln_num:
        solns_copy = list()
        for k in sorted(solns, key=len)[:soln_num]:
            solns_copy.append(k)
        solns = solns_copy
    return solns
```

DEMO

2

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21



É	Chrome	File	Edit	View	History	Book	marks	Prof	files	Tab	Wind	ow	Help		
•	•••	🔊 Num	ber Gan	× <	Home Pa	age X		algorith	nm_cl	×	New	/ Tab	×	+	
\leftarrow	\rightarrow C	(i) lo	calhost	:8889/	noteboo	. 🕀	Û	☆	-	• •		*		M (Update
UP acti mig	DATE Read ions to take ht break so	t <u>he mi</u> if you ome of y	g <u>ration</u> are usir your ex	<u>plan</u> to ng exter tension	Notebool nsions - Pl s.	k 7 to le lease n	earn a ote th	bout th at upda	e new ating t	r featur o Note	res an ebook	d the 7	Dor	n't sho	ow anym
	Jupyte	r a	lgorit	hm_c	clean									ę	Lo
										Not Tru	usted		Pyth	on 3	(ipykern
File	Edit	Viev	v li	nsert	Cell	Kerne	el	Widge	ts	Help					
B	+ %	2	b	• •	▶ Run		CN	Cod	de		~				
		N) (Ma Pro NY	(T Di ay 23, 1 oblem T digits	gits F 2023) Staten s puzzle	Puzzle · nent: Can e given si	- Algo n you c x numl	ome bers a	up with and a t	n som arget	e cod numb	e that er?	find	s the s	soluti	on to th
	In [1]	: fro	om ito om ma	ertoo: th im j	ls impo port com	rt co mb	mbin	ation	ıs						
	In [2]	: # g def	genera genera # de dict # de outp cour # ou if	ates a erator efinin t_len efinin put_di nt = (utput dict 1	all man c_combos ng dict = len(s ng outpo ict = d:) the dia	ipula s(sta: _len start_ ut di ict()	tion rt_d to d _dic ctio	comb ict: eterm t) nary if th	oinat dict nine	ions): path	of d ing ust d	a di one	elem	nary	r of e

```
output_dict = start_dict
```

output all ways to add, subtract, multiply, or divide two



Part I: Hints at Something Deeper Solutions

When we count the number of generated combinations for various lists of numbers we find...

In [10]: for ell in range(1,7):

Is there a way that we can show why this is the case? And also use this to determine the complexity of this algorithm?

```
dict = {str(num):num for num in range(1,ell+1)}
    all_combos = generator_combos(dict_)
    print(f'Number of combinations with {ell} numbers:', len(all_combos))
Number of combinations with 1 numbers: 1
Number of combinations with 2 numbers: 4
Number of combinations with 3 numbers: 48
Number of combinations with 4 numbers: 960
Number of combinations with 5 numbers: 26880
Number of combinations with 6 numbers: 967680
```

Part II: Mathematics

Part II: Counting Combinations

Part II

Mathematics

How can we count the number of solutions* to the puzzle?

$$F(x) = \sum_{k=0}^{N} x^k F_k$$

*We are actually counting the number of "generated combinations" and not exact solutions

Refined Question:

How can we explain the following sequence?

> We have N integers $d_1 < d_2 < \ldots < d_N$. We have four possible operations $\times, \div, +,$ and -. Say that Q_N is the number of different real numbers (that are greater than 1) we can form from combining all *N* integers using the available operations.

*''closed-form'' means we can compute values directly as a function

```
In [10]: for ell in range(1,7):
             dict = {str(num):num for num in range(1,ell+1)}
             all_combos = generator_combos(dict_)
             print(f'Number of combinations with {ell} numbers:', len(all_combos))
         Number of combinations with 1 numbers: 1
         Number of combinations with 2 numbers: 4
         Number of combinations with 3 numbers: 48
         Number of combinations with 4 numbers: 960
         Number of combinations with 5 numbers: 26880
         Number of combinations with 6 numbers: 967680
```

Let's formulate this more abstractly

20. NYT Digits Puzzle

[combinatorics - numbers]

(**Definition**) Q_N is the number of combinations created by this algorithm when there are N numbers (i.e., $Q_1 = 1, Q_2 = 4, Q_3 = 48$, etc.)

Further Refined Question: What is the closed-form^{*} expression for Q_N ?



Part II: Counting Combinations

20. NYT Digits Puzzle

[combinatorics - numbers]

We have N integers $d_1 < d_2 < \ldots < d_N$. We have four possible operations $\times, \div, +,$ and -. Say that Q_N is the number of different real numbers (that are greater than 1) we can form from combining all N integers using the available operations.

Further Refined Question: What is the closed-form expression for Q_N ?

We will proceed as before (i.e., incrementally)

Two-Number Combinations:

$$d_2 + d_1, \quad d_2 - d_1, \quad d_2 \times d_1, \quad d_2/d_1$$

correction for double counting

 $Q_2 = 4$

Or with
$$Q_1 \equiv 1$$

$$Q_4 = \frac{1}{2}Q_2 \left[\begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix} Q \right]$$



 $Q_3Q_1 + \binom{4}{2}Q_2Q_2 + \binom{4}{1}Q_1Q_3$

Part II: Counting Combinations

20. NYT Digits Puzzle

[combinatorics - numbers]

We have *N* integers $d_1 < d_2 < ... < d_N$. We have four possible operations $\times, \div, +$, and -. Say that Q_N is the number of different real numbers (that are greater than 1) we can form from combining all *N* integers using the available operations.

Further Refined Question: What is the closed-form expression for Q_N ?

We can use **dynamic programming** to generate solutions to this equation

```
1 from math import comb
2 import numpy as np
3 
4 Q, Q2 = dict(), 4 # define dictionary and Q2 value
5 Q[1] = 1 # define first dictionary value
6 
7 def Q_calc(N):
8 
9 if N in Q.keys():
10 return Q[N]
11 else:
12 return (Q2//2)*np.sum([comb(N,k)*Q_calc(N-k)*Q_calc(k) for k in range(1,N)])
```

N-1 *Q_N* =

Four-Number Combinations:

$$Q_4 = \frac{1}{2}Q_2 \left[\begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix} Q_3 Q_1 + \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix} Q_2 Q_2 + \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} Q_1 Q_3 \right]$$

N-Number Combinations:

$$= \frac{1}{2}Q_2 \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \binom{N}{k} Q_{N-k}Q_k$$

In	[10]:	<pre>for ell in range(1,7): dict_ = {str(num):num for num in range(1,ell+1)}</pre>									
		<pre>all_combos = generator_combos(dict_) print(f'Number of combinations with {ell} numbers:', len(a)</pre>									
		Number of combinations with 1 numbers: 1									
		Number of combinations with 2 numbers: 4									
		Number of combinations with 3 numbers: 48									
		Number of combinations with 4 numbers: 960									
		Number of combinations with 5 numbers: 26880									
		Number of combinations with 6 numbers: 967680									

Python

```
In [4]: for k in range(1, 7):
    print(f'QN for N={k}: {Q_calc(k)}')
    QN for N=1: 1
    QN for N=2: 4
    QN for N=3: 48
    QN for N=4: 960
    QN for N=5: 26880
    QN for N=6: 967680
```

These solutions match the previous counting of results...

...however this expression is not in closed-form. We still need to solve for Q_{N} .



Part II: Closed form solution

$$Q_{N} = \frac{1}{2}Q_{2}\sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \binom{N}{k} Q_{N-k}Q_{k}$$



Part III: Complexity



Part III: Complexity Class

Part III

Complexity Class

What is the computational complexity class of this problem?

 $P \subseteq NP \subseteq EXP-TIME$



20. NYT Digits Puzzle

[combinatorics - numbers]

We have *N* integers $d_1 < d_2 < \ldots < d_N$. We have four possible operations $\times, \div, +,$ and -. Say that Q_N is the number of different real numbers (that are greater than 1) we can form from combining all *N* integers using the available operations.

$$Q_{N} = N! \left(\frac{Q_{2}}{2}\right)^{N-1} C_{N-1},$$

$$\frac{1}{k+1} \binom{2n}{n}$$
Numbers
Exponential Time
Computation
$$Q_{N} \sim O(2^{3N})$$

$$Q_{2} = 4$$

"As N increases it eventually becomes impossible to list every solution"

NYT Digits Puzzle \subseteq EXP-TIME

Presentation Outline



Part I

Algorithms

How can we generate all possible solutions to the NYT digits problem?

def nyt_digits_solver(num_list:

```
# generating full list of co
soln_set_dict = dict()
for i in range(2, len(num_list))
```





Mathematics

How can we count the number of solutions to the puzzle?

$$Q_N = N! \left(\frac{Q_2}{2}\right)^{N-1} C_{N-1},$$

Part IV: ChatGPT

General Algorithm



I.You are given six numbers and a target number.

2. The goal is to reproduce the target number from any combination from the set of six numbers using the operations addition, subtraction, division, and multiplication.

3. In combining numbers, divisions cannot have remainders and subtractions cannot result in negative numbers.



DEMO

•



>

We are going to play a game. In this game there is a list of six numbers and also a target number. The objective of the game is to reproduce the target number from any combination from the set of six numbers using the operations addition, subtraction, division, and multiplication. In combining numbers, divisions cannot have remainders and subtractions cannot result in negative numbers. Do you understand the rules of the game?



July 25, 2023



Requisite XKCD comic

OUR ANALYSIS SHOWS THAT THERE ARE THREE KINDS OF PEOPLE IN THE WORLD: THOSE WHO USE K-MEANS CLUSTERING WITH K=3, AND TWO OTHER TYPES WHOSE QUALITATIVE INTERPRETATION 15 UNCLEAR.



https://xkcd.com/2731/



References

https://mobowill.com/nyt-digits-puzzle-solution-algorithm/

https://mobowill.com/nyt-digits-puzzle-mathamtics/

https://math.mit.edu/~rstan/transparencies/miami_catalan.pdf

[JFR Research Day] Programmatic Solution to NYT Connections

